A POLICY FRAMEWORK TO SUPPORT A NEW SOCIAL SETTLEMENT IN TAFE

JOHN CAIN FOUNDATION
CENTRE FOR VOCATIONAL AND EDUCATIONAL POLICY,
MELBOURNE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF EDUCATION, UNIVERSITY OF MELBOURNE

LEESA WHEELAHAN
19 FEBRUARY 2019
THANK YOU FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY

• This work has been commissioned by the John Cain Foundation
  o Very grateful for this support, and for Brian Howe’s constant demands to think more deeply

• This work is the culmination of work over years including:
  o Gavin Moodie, previously RMIT, now OISE
  o John Buchanan, University of Sydney with Serena Yu, now UTS
  o Pat Forward, formerly federal secretary of the TAFE Division of the AEU
  o Mary Leahy, John Polesel, Kira Clarke, Sophie Arkoudis all of the University of Melbourne, and Emmaline Bexley, previously University of Melbourne, now Monash
  o Shelley Mallet, Brotherhood of St Laurence & University of Melbourne
PUT THE REFORMS TO VET OVER THE LAST 30 YEARS IN SOME CONTEXT
AUSTRALIA HAS LOTS OF EXPERIENCE IN PRIVATISING & MARKETISING PUBLIC SERVICES
CHILDCARE

• Collapse ABC Learn 2009 (too big to fail)
• Predatory practices, badly trained staff (by for profits)
• Result, more regulation, bailouts by government & public & not-for-profit sector

Source: http://mrg.bz/875b99
EMPLOYMENT & JOB NETWORK SERVICES

• ACOSS 2018 survey

Voices of Unemployment

Result of an ACOSS survey of jobactive service users

October 2018

Appalling cases of abuse in aged care facilities prompt royal commission

AGED care facilities are meant to provide care for vulnerable, elderly residents. But a spate of appalling cases of abuse in Australian nursing homes has prompted a royal commission.

AND JUST TO SHOW WE HAVEN’T FINISHED

DISABILITIES SECTOR

Royal commission calls grow as disability campaigners tell stories of abuse and trauma

ABC News
6 hours ago
TAFE staff numbers in decline along with funding
TAFE numbers down
Posted 30 May 2014, 2:36pm
WA Government rejects claim higher fees deterring TAFE students.

Skills reform a "shemozzle", says ex-TAFE chief

Victorian cuts 'immoral': TAFE chiefs - The Australian

Students are gaining worthless certificates through dodgy courses,

College claims to belong to international agency it owns

Four-day diplomas for the workers, Bali trip for the boss

TAFE scandals inevitable in race to bottom

TAFE funding plunges, financial watchdog report shows

VET in crisis as pressure mounts | The Australian

PPP virus spreads through VET system | The Australian

VET complexity 'worse under market' | The Australian

VET panel chief John Hart denies being refused registration
WHEN WILL WE LEARN?

• In all cases, public and not-for-profit sector been forced to compete in for-profit markets with for-profits fueled by public subsidies so that we have a marketised, privatized and predominately commercial undertaking

• In all cases, the response has been more and more regulation to try to tie down bad behaviour – always after it has happened.

Source: https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/1/19/Train_wreck_at_Montparnasse_1895.jpg
THE COMPOSITION OF PUBLICLY FUNDED VOCATIONAL EDUCATION HAS CHANGED
NO. OF PUBLICLY FUNDED HOURS 2008 - 2017

Source: NCVER (2018: Table 12)
Historical time series of government-funded vocational education and training from 1981 to 2017
Historical time series of government-funded vocational education and training from 1981 to 2017

Source: NCVER (2018: Table 12)
COMPARED TO 34% GROWTH IN HIGHER EDUCATION OVER SIMILAR TIME

Domestic undergraduate EFTSL 2008 to 2016
PUBLICLY FUNDED HOURS BY SYSTEM BY YEAR 2008 - 2017

Size of systems by year

- NSW
- Vic
- QLD
- SA
- WA
- ACT
- TAS
- NT
NSW’S SYSTEM SMALLER THAN VICTORIA’S SINCE 2011
LINKS TO JOBS WEAK & DECLINE IN FUNDING

• Percentage of VET graduates in same occupation as training course in 2018:
  o 27.2% overall all VET graduates
  o 29.3% overall government funded VET graduates

• Government funding per training hour declined by almost 13% between 2008 to 2016

• Source: NCVER (2018: Table 13) VET student outcomes 2018 & Government-funded student outcomes 2018

Source: https://cdn.pixabay.com/photo/2014/03/25/17/01/chain-297842_960_720.png
CURRENT ORTHODOXY IN VOCATIONAL EDUCATION: HUMAN CAPITAL THEORY
EXCEPT HUMAN CAPITAL THEORY DOESN’T WORK
LIMITATIONS OF HUMAN CAPITAL

The relation between education, skills and economic growth is not:
• simple
• linear
• from supply to demand for skills
Economic development is cyclical, not linear
• Ignores local and regional contexts

(Tickly, 2013: 13)

Source: https://i.imgur.com/941lGW7.png
THIS 30 YEAR EXPERIMENT HAS NOT WORKED

Interconnected elements of New Public Management theory – market as arbiter of social value
MOVING BEYOND NARROW MODELS OF SKILL DEVELOPMENT

Kim Beazley Snr in Tabling the Report of the Kangan Committee in 1974:

“The report envisages a major shift of emphasis. It abandons the narrow and rigid concept that technical colleges exist simply to meet the manpower needs of industry, and adopts a broader concept that they exist to meet the needs of people as individuals” (cited in Goozee, 2001: 27).
CHALLENGE

Modernise Kangan vision so that TAFE is again part of our social infrastructure, as the anchor for:

- The VET system as the public institution fulfilling public policy objectives
- Social inclusion & sustainable regional economic & social development

Based on deep connections with local communities & employers

Providing locally responsive qualifications & provision that individuals, employers & unions have reason to value

Underpinned by capabilities approach in governance, funding & curriculum

We’ve used the notion of productive capabilities
CAPABILITIES APPROACH

• Enable people to live lives they have reason to value

• Productive capabilities – capabilities to underpin vocational education

• Consider the person, their occupation & their community

• Support sustainable, regional economic & social development
CAPABILITIES ARE ABOUT OPPORTUNITIES & POSSIBILITIES

Source:
https://cdn.pixabay.com/photo/2014/07/18/08/38/opportunity-396265_960_720.jpg
FUNCTIONINGS ARE ABOUT OUTCOMES

Source: https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/7/71/Fork_in_the_road_for_Brunslow_-_geograph.org.uk_-_873046.jpg
FROM HUMAN CAPITAL TO PRODUCTIVE CAPABILITIES

- TAFE & TAFE teachers blamed
- Human capital theory
- Instrumental purposes of TVET
- Privatisation
- Marketisation
- Public institutions as interchangeable providers

- Governance
- TAFE as the anchor
- A new model of qualifications
- Vocations & vocational streams
- Local enabling institutions
- Teachers as dual professionals
A NEW SOCIAL SETTLEMENT BASED ON THE CAPABILITIES APPROACH – PRODUCTIVE CAPABILITIES IN VOCATIONAL EDUCATION

High trust system with trusted qualifications that government, students, employers, unions, communities & industries have reason to value
With a different mission to schools & universities
A NEW SOCIAL SETTLEMENT BASED ON PRODUCTIVE CAPABILITIES

Implications for governance
• Emphasise regions, regional economic & social development
• Capabilities approach emphasises importance of local actors
• Appropriate federal governance arrangements – don’t be distracted by idea of federal takeover
A NEW SOCIAL SETTLEMENT BASED ON PRODUCTIVE CAPABILITIES

TAFE as the local mediating actor working with its local partners
• Delivering locally developed qualifications with employer input
• Based on a high trust quality assurance system, with minimalist standards
• In partnership with schools & universities

Funding for institutions not programs
• Most graduates don’t work in jobs associated with qualifications
• ‘Picking winners’ doesn’t work
• TAFE trusted to deliver programs needed by region & communities
• Responsive funding mechanisms to support the most disadvantaged
A NEW SOCIAL SETTLEMENT BASED ON PRODUCTIVE CAPABILITIES

New qualifications with three goals:
1. Support entry to & progression in the labour market
2. Support educational pathways & lifelong learning
3. Widen access to education & support social inclusion & citizens
A NEW SOCIAL SETTLEMENT BASED ON PRODUCTIVE CAPABILITIES

Vocational streams
• Linked occupations that share similar requirements & serve related purpose (eg, care occupations)

Vocations
• Shared knowledge and skills in occupations, to better link vocational education & labour market
A NEW SOCIAL SETTLEMENT BASED ON PRODUCTIVE CAPABILITIES

An enabling policy framework
- Builds communities of trust based on partnerships between TAFE, local communities & industry
- One that supports institutional quality & teacher quality
- Builds intermediary bodies that link TAFE & regions & TAFE & industry
A NEW SOCIAL SETTLEMENT BASED ON PRODUCTIVE CAPABILITIES

- Teachers as dual-professionals
  - Investment in teacher development & teacher education qualifications
  - Teachers who are both industry experts & expert teachers
  - Who can work with industry partners to anticipate future needs & codify & institutionalise knowledge & skills needed for the future
  - Work with disadvantaged communities & support disadvantaged students to become successful learners, workers & citizens
A DISTINCTIVE MISSION FOR TAFE

Move away from residual definition – doing what schools & universities don’t do

Local powerhouses for regional social development

Develop, codify & institutionalise knowledge and skills needed for changing world of work

Research how work is changing using local knowledge & insights from applied disciplines

Based on concept of human development
THANK YOU!
LEESA.WHEELAHAN@UTORONTO.CA
EXTRA RESOURCES

The following slides show the publicly funded number of hours in each state and territory

They show:

• The number of hours for each system from 2008 - 2017
• The share of hours by TAFE, ACE & private providers
Victoria publicly funded hours in VET

- TAFEs
- ACE
- PPs
South Australia publicly funded hours in VET

- TAFEs
- ACE
- PPs

Year:
- 2008
- 2009
- 2010
- 2011
- 2012
- 2013
- 2014
- 2015
- 2016
- 2017