UNESCO Observatory
Multi-Disciplinary Journal in the Arts

SPECIAL ISSUE
A/r/tography and the Literary and Performing Arts

Volume 3 | Issue 2 | 2013

Guest Editors
Rita L. Irwin
Anita Sinner

Editor
Lindy Joubert

Associate Editor
Naomi Berman

Designer
Rosie Ren
The UNESCO Observatory refereed e-journal is based within the Graduate School of Education at The University of Melbourne, Australia. The journal promotes multi-disciplinary research in the Arts and Education and arose out of a recognised need for knowledge sharing in the field. The publication of diverse arts and cultural experiences within a multi-disciplinary context informs the development of future initiatives in this expanding field. There are many instances where the arts work successfully in collaboration with formerly non-traditional partners such as the sciences and health care, and this peer-reviewed journal aims to publish examples of excellence.

Valuable contributions from international researchers are providing evidence of the impact of the arts on individuals, groups and organisations across all sectors of society. The UNESCO Observatory refereed e-journal is a clearing house of research which can be used to support advocacy processes; to improve practice; influence policy making, and benefit the integration of the arts in formal and non-formal educational systems across communities, regions and countries.

ISSN 1835 - 2776

Published in Australia

Published by
The Graduate School of Education
© The University of Melbourne

The University of Melbourne, Parkville, Victoria 3010.
To be engaged in the practice of a/r/tography means to inquire in the world through an ongoing process of art making in any art form and writing not separate or illustrative of each other but interconnected and woven through each other to create relational and/or enhanced meanings. A/r/tographical work are often rendered through the methodological concepts of contiguity, living inquiry, openings, metaphor/metonymy, reverberations and excess, which are enacted and performed when a relational aesthetic inquiry condition is envisioned as embodied understandings and exchanges between art and text, and between and among the broadly conceived identities of artist/researcher/teacher. A/r/tography is inherently about self as artist/researcher/teacher yet it is also social when groups or communities of a/r/tographers come together to engage in shared inquiries, act as critical friends, articulate an evolution of research questions, and present their collective evocative/provocative works to others (see http://m1.cust.educ.ubc.ca/Artography/).

This special issue of Multi-Disciplinary Research in the Arts invites original creative and scholarly inquiry that engages in critical debates and issues regarding a/r/tographical methodologies; are exemplars of critical approaches to a/r/tographical research; and/or extend the boundaries of inquiry-based research. Contributions are welcome from disciplines across the arts, humanities and social sciences and in a wide range of formats including articles, essays, and artistic interludes, which explore diverse forms of the arts from drama, dance, poetry, narrative, music, visual arts, digital media and more.
The metaphor of tonality in artography

Peter Gouzouasis
The University of British Columbia

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this essay is to illuminate the application of arts-based forms of research in music education research. Since substantial literature supports the core renderings of artography as a mode of scholarly inquiry, arts-based research needs to be recognized as a potential mode of research in music education. My composition becomes one example of how I demonstrate metaphor to be transformative as I write autobiography as method that embraces artography—a hybrid research form that in this essay employs narrative, autoethnography, lyrics, poetry, music, and pedagogical inquiry—as a music research method. This entails moving beyond the existing rules-based disciplines of music and music education, with a shift toward an understanding of the importance of a multidimensional approach to the values and subjectivity of music and music education research. Autobiography enables me to interrogate the changes, or ruptures, that un/fold as writing metaphorically draws me into the complexities of diatonic tonality (modality). Thus, metaphor propels me to fuse autobiography and tonality to “clarify the conditions in which understandings take place” (Gadamer, 1975, p. 263). Overall, I propose arts-based educational research as embodied, living inquiry through metaphor, as I write myself through music and text to reconcile the inherent complications of legitimizing arts-based research in music education contexts.

KEYWORDS

a/r/tography, arts-based educational research, music autoethnography, poetic representation, tonality, autobiography, metaphor, living inquiry, tèchne, poiēsis, hermeneutics, Gadamer, relational metatheory
TONAL EXPLORATION 1: MIXOLYDIAN TONALITY

REVERSE THEME AND VARIATIONS

In February 2005, the artography group performed at the Qualitative Inquiry Group conference in Athens, Georgia. Rita Irwin provided a wonderful collection of images, Carl Leggo crafted some amazing poetry, and Kit Grauer wrote some excellent narrative. We had at least 12 meetings organizing this presentation, honing the narrative, and conceiving the way that the performance—our first as a performative research ensemble—would unfold. I brought a guitar to each session and began improvising patterns—short thematic segments that initially were unrelated until an idea surfaced, Benjamin Britten’s *Nocturnal*. The *Nocturnal* is a reverse theme and variations based on the John Dowland lute song, *Come Heavy Sleep*. I had performed the Britten piece, along with the Villa Lobos *Sextour Mystique*, for the Contemporary Players (led by composer-professor Clifford Taylor) in the Fall of 1977 at Temple University’s Tyler School of Art. In 1982, I transcribed *Come Heavy Sleep* for lute and four voices (SATB) from the original lute tablature, and adapted it to guitar, for small vocal ensemble led by Alan Harler, one of my most dearly held music mentors from 1982-1990. So I was very familiar with playing Britten and Dowland, as well as with the composition styles and components of both compositions.

I mention these details because I believe that the implementation of music in arts based education research needs to be informed by serious thoughts about the form and function of the music. Moreover, the music cannot be treated as aural window dressing, wallpaper, or elevator music. The art needs to inform the research, and the research needs to inform the art form. The two are inextricable, and in this way, music can function as both an explanatory and aesthetic metaphor.

With those experiences and thoughts in mind, I began to conceptualize our first performance presentation of artography as a reverse theme and variations. Every time my colleagues read and spoke about particular concepts in our script, which I began to think of as lyrics or a libretto, the same or varied patterns were iterated and reiterated. In that manner, the music provided an aural fabric that wove the spoken themes together. As the presentation progressed, the various fragments became more developed to parallel and compliment the development of our conceptual propositions. I added a capo to the third fret of the guitar to sound in the same range as a Renaissance lute. Particular music fragments became inextricable from particular spoken concepts. Moreover, motivic ideas were associated with the images, nuances of images, and the readers themselves (Kit, Carl, Rita, and myself). And as the presentation evolved, a composition evolved (presented in the following audio file)—both in our narrative, in the visual images, and in the music. Unfortunately, the entire performance was not recorded with video or audio equipment and

i Not unlike the structure of the present inquiry.
our attempts to synthetically recreate it by merely reading the texts into a digital recording device could not capture the aesthetic qualities of the initial visual art, text, and music performance.

Resonance, reverberation

TONAL EXPLORATION 2: MINOR TONALITY

VIVALDI CONJURES MY HENDRIX HEART

At the American Education Research Association Conference in 2005, the artography team of Gouzouasis, Grauer, Irwin, & Leggo performed their research inextricably liked to Vivaldi’s “Four Seasons.” A portion of that presentation is available on an Internet site (see http://m2.edcp.ubc.ca/artog/aera.php). I chose to adopt the second movement, Summer, as the music for my presentation. While I have created a number of similar works with my colleagues, and composed original music for a number of our research paper presentations, the most frustrating aspect of composing music for a research paper is that as much time and effort goes into the music as the text, and the audience never asks questions about the music. I am not sure why, but there are a few plausible explanations. To many in a conference audience, music may seem like a pleasant background for the presentation—a pretty, aesthetically crafted accompaniment—nothing more, nothing less. Music wallpaper. We are a visually oriented society, and most listeners know little about music other than what they like and what they don’t like. Most of the conference participants can read and write about metaphor and metonymy, but it is difficult to listen to and conceptualize metaphoric and metonymic possibilities in music, as well as in multimedia presentations that include visual art, music, prose, poetry, and narrative.

For me, it seems pedantic to write an entire paper that explains and interprets how music functions in arts based educational research. My poet and visual artist artographer colleagues don’t do it, and the audience seems to understand the visual connections between the prose, poetry, photographs, and installations. But the music is never mentioned, and it is never considered as an important contribution to developing an understanding of the concepts that we present. For this artographic project, I transcribed the first and third movement of the Vivaldi into a music software program and re-orchestrated the score using a variety of plucked, synthesized, string instruments e.g., guitars and bouzoukee, also marimbas, and xylophones and recorded it from the music software to a digital audio file. I narrated the music

ii However, out of frustration of never being asked questions about my contribution to an artography based performance piece, I have done so herein.

iii “I do not focus my writing on theoretical, philosophical, and scholarly arguments to defend and explain autobiography. I am not trying to convince readers about the efficacy of autobiographical research for composition, curriculum, and pedagogy. Instead I invite a conversation. I seek to engage readers with a performance in words. My concern is ultimately an ethical conviction. Simply, I think we live with too many lies, and, therefore, with little sense of who we are and who we can be” (Leggo, 2005, p. 132). In June 2005, Carl and I performed a parallel version of this text, woven with my own stories that ran along Carl’s. For that performance, I composed a song based on one of his poems and composed a soundtrack to another of his poems. The manuscript, song, and soundtrack are available upon request.
with a backdrop of original photographs of Greece, taken in the summer of 1980 with Kodachrome 25 film and digitally scanned the slides, creating a 12-minute multimedia presentation. The focus of the narrative was on Aristotle's notions of technē (art), phronesis (practical wisdom), knowing (theoria; related to wisdom, or sofia), doing (praxis), and artful production and making (poiēsis), concepts that were being explored by the artography group between 2005-2007. The presentation text and multimedia were created at the same time I wrote a paper, however, due to limitations of print and online journals, the whole composition has never appeared in a single publication venue. iv

The second movement of the Vivaldi Concerto No. 2 in G minor (Opus 8, RV 315) is composed for solo violin with homophonic accompaniment, very typical for this style of Baroque concerto. As with the first and third movements, I transcribed the entire score and changed the instrumentation from strings to a variety of synthesized guitars. I performed the solo violin part live during the presentation, on a Peavy EVH electric guitar, v heavily distorted through a rectifier-modelled guitar amplifier (i.e., think “Hendrix” and his sustained, distorted guitar sound). Because the performance could never be published, and at the time could not be published in a refereed journal as link to a paper, this work was never disseminated. However, for me, the entire process of painstakingly researching Vivaldi scores, entering the music into a digital format, re-orchestrating the score, selecting the images, scanning them and photo-realistically editing them, writing (editing) and recording the narrative, learning and performing the solo violin part of the second movement, and writing the paper was related to the very topic of the presentation—technē, phronesis, knowing, praxis, and poiēsis. Moreover, to say that my performance served as an excessive disruption is an understatement. On yet another level, excess is one of the original renderings of artography (Springgay, Irwin, Leggo, & Gouzouasis, 2008) and no guitarist in the 20th century was better known for disruption and excess than Jimi Hendrix, whose style I imitate in the performance. That the presentation was refereed (i.e., all AERA papers and presentations are blind refereed) should classify this integrated multimedia composition as a refereed journal performance composition, however, there are no digital journals that accept this genre of work as a piece of research that stands on its own. vi

METAPHOR IN ARTOGRAPHY

“... the future and past only exist (really exist) in stories. Neither is real. The future isn't here yet so it isn't real, and the past is gone and so it's not real (anymore) either” (Larson, 2011).

Artography has provided me with many opportunities to explore myself from a holistic perspective, living as a musicianresearcherteacher. In 2006, I wrote an introductory piece on the possibilities of conceptualizing living as a musician as artographer. vii Two years later, I removed the slashes from the term artography, a symbolic gesture through which I declared myself a whole person in mind, brain, body, and spirit. It may seem odd to feel the need to make such a declaration in this day and age, since holism is not a new concept. It may be traced back to Gestalt psychology of the early 20th century (see Humphrey, 1924; Boeree, 1999) and to organismic principles

---

iv See Gouzouasis, 2006 for the textual representation of my paper; both files are also available on academia.edu

v I own a custom shop Peavey Eddie Van Halen 'Wolfgang' signature model guitar.

vi Moreover, it is disappointing that the majority of online journals are unable to accommodate embedded audio and video files into the pdfs of text-based articles.

vii I removed the slashes from the term artography because I do not believe in artificial splits, living as an “artist-researcherteacher.”
Organicism is based on the root metaphor of a dynamic, organic whole (Pepper, 1982). I believe that Pepper’s model (1942) of “world views,” based on his “root metaphor theory” that included the four metaphors of formism, mechanism, organicism, and contextualism, has always superseded the somewhat shortsighted, paradigmatic, dualistic perspectives offered through the lens of modernist—postmodernist paradigms.

For Pepper, metaphors are used somewhat differently in philosophy than in poetry, and all the arts, in that they are primarily explanatory and not merely aesthetic devices. “It is not just a simile with the preposition “like” left out. It is rather the use of one part of experience to illuminate another—to help us understand, comprehend, even to intuit, or enter into the other” (Pepper, 1982, p. 197). Of course, one of the core renderings of artography is metaphor (and metonymy) and for artographers; while no artographer has explicitly taken this stance, metaphor may function on both explanatory and aesthetic levels. In Pepper’s words, “the boundary between the aesthetic and the explanatory use of metaphor is admittedly vague. A philosopher may even deliberately select a metaphor for its aesthetic vividness and impact (as with Henri Bergson’s “élan vital” or William James’s “stream of consciousness”), but the question of the metaphor’s having philosophical relevance depends on its explanatory function” (p. 197).

With the lens I have provided leading to this point in my inquiry, the purpose of the remainder essay is to explore and explain the possibilities, on explanatory and aesthetic levels, of the music concept, tonality. Eisner (2005) posited that the form of the research influences the art form and the art form influences the research. I use that concept as a guiding principle in conducting arts based educational research. I have used the term tonality in the title of a recent book (Gouzouasis, 2011) and have also used the music concept of form to write about musician identities (e.g., fugue, sonata, theme and variations), McLuhan’s tetrads (e.g., sonata), and philosophy (e.g., toccata). Thus, the specific problem of my inquiry is to determine the extent to which the notion of tonality functions as an artographic rendering, that is, metaphor, not merely in writing but in music. In the spirit of arts-based research, I invite the reader to engage in this composition with “an enlightened ear” (with profound respect for Elliott Eisner, 1991).
both a person and agent in the development of a person-centered theory of mind that includes not only notions of cognition, but emotions, wishes, and desires. Thus, relational metatheory extends the organicist notion of human as dynamic, organic whole. From a relational metatheoretical perspective, mind is embodied, it is person-centered, and includes both biological and socio-cultural contexts (pp. 34-35). Based on that perspective alone, one may readily reject artificial splits and dichotomies such as mind-body, nature-nurture, subject-object, reason-emotion that have been perpetrated by modernist and post-modernist thinkers in the 20th century. From that metatheoretical platform, I can state with certainty that I am an embodied human being—an interactive, fully participating, mindful, spiritual, part of the biological-cultural world in which we live, ever changing, ever growing, ever striving, ever becoming.

“Stories have the power to direct and change our lives” (Noddings, p. 157).

Only recently have a handful of music educators accepted narrative research techniques into the canon of music research methodology. Even fewer have embraced arts-based educational research (ABER) as a possibility for studying music learning and thinking. That seems odd given how visual arts, dance, and drama educators have adopted and extended those research practices over the past two decades. There are a few plausible explanations. It may have something to do with the strict, Western classical music, conservatory based training that many music educators undergo to become music researchers. In many ways, music is a rule based discipline—there are rules for harmony, counterpoint, and other aspects of composition—and forms, in terms of music organizational structures, abound across all styles of music. There are rules and specific techniques for playing instruments and singing, as well as somewhat rigid, accepted performance practices. It may also be a product of continued work in conservatories throughout most of their careers. Thus, as an extension of a rule based upbringing and continuing careers in the same institution, that may be why notions of traditionalist rules abound in the research programs of most music education researchers.

Instead of jumping into contemporary, 21st century explorations in narrative, the exploration and use of narrative research in music education seems to be following a recapitulation of the history of development of narrative research (see Barrett & Staufer, 2009). That does not seem unusual to me given how university trained musicians are rigidly taught the history of Western music and music composition (e.g., Grout, 1974). In learning the basics of music composition, learning species counterpoint precedes fugue, which precedes 19th and 20th century contrapuntal techniques and harmony. In learning the history of music, students begin with Gregorian chant and progress through the centuries, devoid of the socio-cultural contexts in which music was composed from 600AD to the present.

That is why, on another level, given the subjectivity involved in many aspects of music composition and music learning, it seems odd that music researchers are more interested in measuring music learning and aesthetic responses than describing music learning with rich textual descriptions, descriptions that include a multiplicity of representations in audio and visual contexts. To compound that oddity, most music researchers attempt to describe music learning, music making, music engagement, and life experiences in music without music itself (i.e., digital audio and video)
in print and online journals. And the majority of applied music research over the past 90 years has taken place in traditional, school music settings, concerned with music learning and teaching of traditional school music curricula. This is a paradox considering that a minority of students in schools are engaged in school music making, school music has little to do with the music of popular culture, most music making and music learning in the 21st century is learner centered and learner directed (Gouzouasis & Bakan, 2011).

**We may be neglectful of the fact that the effectiveness of writing may have more to do with the being of the writer—who a writer is.**

Since my first foray into narrative research (Gouzouasis, 1996), I have paid little attention to the rigid, rigorous rules that seem to be set up as barriers by the profession and most professional music education journals. Living with educational researchers who adopted new research methodologies as early as the 1980s afforded me the freedom to experiment and improvise with new research forms. Storying the story, living poetically, and performing research are actively supported and encouraged in my research community.

Eight weeks after major surgery in the summer of 1997 had landed me in Lions Gate Hospital, I ran into a poet colleague at the pub in the University of British Columbia Golf club. Based on deep, personal reflections while lying in a hospital bed for 7 weeks, not knowing whether I would live or die, I told him that I planned to “live (my life) musically” from the day I left the hospital. That simple phrase, *live my life musically*, has not only inspired my musicianship, thinking, and writing in the past 15 years—it also inspired others to spin that notion into a number of publications that in turn have invigorated, infused, and influenced my thinking over the past 15 years. Thus, in an interactive dialectic, I learn from the stories of my colleagues and students, as they learn from me.

> “We need to tell our stories more. And we need to tell more stories. In the end, the stories we write and tell about our living experiences will teach us how to live with more creativity, confidence, flexibility, coherence, imagination, and truthfulness” (Leggo, 2005, p. 132).

The short stories included as tonal explorations at the beginning of this essay were based upon lived experiences. They are μυθιστόρημα (i.e., mythystoryma)—“novel” stories that are personal, autobiographical, and telling of myself. They may be considered a part of a practice of living inquiry (Aoki, 1991; Irwin & deCosson, 2004; Gouzouasis, 2006) that is not new in educational research, but is relatively unheard of in music education research. They are stories that are pedagogical in nature, and may be used in a variety of music teaching and learning contexts. As such, it is reasonable to suggest that different forms of representation need to be introduced, in new forms of composition, for music research.

> “I think and gather information like an ethnographer, but I try to write like a novelist or storyteller” (Ellis, 2004, p. 335).

As a musician, I think about all of my life experiences and music expertise and how that influences my perspectives of music creation, music making, music learning, and music research. I cannot deny that those perspectives greatly influence the ways...
that I approach a research project and frame my research questions, and I freely acknowledge the notion that all data—in quantitative and qualitative contexts—are not only theory laden (Pepper, 1942; Kuhn, 1962; Gouzouasis, 2008), are value laden. Data are heavily influenced by the ways that we think about, conduct, and write the research with which we are engaged. The very ways that we frame a research question implies a research design, a particular methodology, and a form of analysis. Thus, the results have the researcher’s thoughts, feeling, beliefs, and attitudes toward the topic woven into the very fabric of the findings and so called “conclusions.”

“Without the heart pumping its words, we are nothing but an outdated dictionary, untouched” (Pelias, 2004, p. 7).

No matter how realist (Sparkes, 2002, Van Mannen, 1988) and traditionally structured music education narratives (including historical and philosophical essays and the little narrative research that has been published to date) have been to this point in time they may be considered as value laden as any contemporary forms of arts based research. Yet, there seems to be a hesitation to let go of the rules—the canon of music education research—and to break them like so many composers and performers have in music and performance as music practices have evolved over the centuries. Like silent films of the 20st century, the sound of music is strangely omitted from our published research and most conference presentations. Our voices have been muted by our own canons and artificially created boundaries. The music profession seems unwilling to acknowledge this conundrum, as well as identify the possibilities that new research forms offer researchers. Thus, my dedication to arts based research continuously folds and unfurls into a dynamic whole, one that embraces change, differences, difficulties, tensions, the sounds of music, unanswerable research questions, infinite possibilities, and multiple forms of representation that our art form invites.

“Stories are the glue that joins the future with the past through the present” Larson, 2011, p. 17.

Tonality is the music metaphor for the present paper, because it resonates with me as a concept that is embraced across music forms and cultures. I have lived my entire life multi-culturally and multi-tonally, and have been blessed to perform and listen to music with musicians from around the world. From one theoretical perspective, a musically literate person derives meaning from Western music in terms of understanding meter and tonality (Gordon, 1989).xiv Meters and tonalities may be defined by music syntax. Syntax in a metric and tonal context refers to the organization and structure of beat and pitch, respectively. While meter is concerned with the systematic organization of beat, tonality is concerned with the systematic organization of pitch (Gouzouasis, 1991). The Harvard Dictionary of Music (Apel, 1969) contains the definition of tonality, “… in non-Western cultures, in Gregorian chant, and in harmonized music—practically every single piece gives preference to one tone (the tonic), making this the tonal center to which all other tones are related” (p. 855). In other words, a tonal center or resting tone can be identified in both unharmonized melodic passages and harmonized passages.

Though the terms “tonality” and “modality” are often considered as descriptive of separate harmonic systems, for the purposes of developing the metaphor in this paper and in terms of the definition of tonality as the relationship of notes in a piece...
of music to a tonic note or tonal center, my definition of tonality includes major and minor as well as the terms dorian, phrygian, lydian, mixolydian, and aeolian. The applications and use of those tonalities varies greatly in folk, jazz, and popular music of the twentieth century, as does the use of the term “modality” by some musicians to describe music of 19th and 20th century composers including Beethoven, Chopin, Vaughn Williams, and Debussy (Apel, 1969, p. 534), as well as jazz, rock, heavy metal, and folk music forms.

My view of tonality provides an extension of that definition, and prepared the way I applied the metaphor. Traditionally speaking, most Western music is written in diatonic tonality, and a diatonic scale is made up of seven (7) pitches separated by half steps and whole steps. If one imagines a piano keyboard, when one plays from the note C, and ascends seven steps on the keyboard to C’, the intervallic space between the pitches are whole-whole-half-whole-whole-whole-half. Another way one may think of it is by singing the scalar pattern, “do-re-mi-fa-sol-la-ti-do.” That relationship between pitches creates the sound of what we call major tonality. Regardless of the key signature, all major keys have the same arrangement of pitches. In other words, I can sing “do-re-mi-fa-sol-la-ti-do” beginning on the pitch C or on the pitch G (or any pitch for that matter) and as long as I maintain the “do-re-mi-fa-sol-la-ti-do” pattern, it will sound “major.”

Major tonality is overwhelmingly used to compose popular music and folk songs in the West. Depending upon one’s vocal range, many people can sing any song in 12 different keys; a singer can change the key (i.e., starting pitch) of a song, but it still sounds like the same song because the pitch relationships and the melodic contour remain the same. So, comparatively speaking, a key shift is less dramatic than a shift in tonality. Moreover, a philosophy in a new key (see Langer, 1941) or curriculum in a new key (see Pinar & Irwin, 2005) is less radical than a philosophy in a new tonality, curriculum in a new tonality, pedagogy in a new tonality (see Gouzouasis, 2011) or research methodology in a new tonality.

There are 6 other diatonic tonalities—dorian, phrygian, lydian, mixolydian, aeolian (natural minor), and locrian—that can be played across 12 key areas (e.g., A natural minor, D natural minor, G natural minor, etc.). When the composer Gustav Mahler drew upon the French folksong “Frère Jacques” (“Bruder Martin” in German) as the theme of the third movement in his Symphony #1 in D major, he changed the tonality of that simple folksong from major to aeolian (i.e., D natural minor). Unless one listens very carefully, most casual listeners rarely notice that the theme is a transposition of a traditional folksong from major to minor tonality. That seemingly simple shift in tonality—also referred to as “modality”—changes the character and mood of the theme, as Mahler’s extra-musical, loosely based, disguised, dramatic idea is that of a procession in a hunter’s funeral.

In jazz, all tonalities—and the “synthetic” scales that emanate from those tonalities—have specific, interesting functions and complex applications. By the mid-1950s, jazz musicians were experimenting with the implementation of different tonalities in composition and improvisation (e.g., Lenny Tristano in New York City, Dennis Sandole in Philadelphia, and other early innovators that they influenced). By the early 1960s, “modal music” (i.e., music composed in dorian, phrygian, lydian, mixolydian, aeolian, and locrian tonalities) dominated the music soundscape (see...
Miles Davis’s Quintet and subsequent groups that were formed by members of Miles’ band. In my personal experiences over the past 50 years of playing guitar, major and natural minor appear most frequently in popular music (including popular folk music of the 1950s and 1960s); dorian and mixolydian are frequently encountered in Irish, traditional folk music, blues, and rock; dorian, major, harmonic and melodic minor in traditional (pre-1960s) and rembetika Greek music; all diatonic tonalities are encountered and applied in various genres of jazz.

Moreover, different tunings on the guitar facilitate playing particular melodic and harmonic aspects of some tonalities. For example, whereas the guitar is usually tuned EADGBE (from 6th to 1st string) and can be used to play in either tonality, DADGAD tuning “opens” different harmonic possibilities when performing Irish instrumental music in dorian, mixolydian and aeolian tonalities. And for me, when I shift from one tuning to another, my approach to playing changes radically. A chord shape that may sound one way in standard tuning sounds very different in DADGAD—it is a different system of thinking, akin to playing a different instrument. However, it is “still” a guitar, and that creative space of playing the familiar (i.e., a guitar), in an unfamiliar way (i.e., a radically different tuning), changes the ways that I think about music performance and composition. My understandings of words—in stories, poems, lyrics and other texts—are shifted, by thinking about the effects of tonalities and its affect on music.

North Vancouver Sunset

Poetry informs through metaphor

“For my mother’s sleep I fell into the State,
And I hunched in its belly till my wet fur froze.
Six miles from earth, loosed from its dream of life,
I woke to black flak and the nightmare fighters.
When I died they washed me out of the turret with a hose.”
- Randall Jarrell, 1945

I memorized and recited this poem in my freshman year of secondary school, and before my experiences in Grade 9 English, I never realized the extent to which poets use literary devices to craft their poetry. As we know, poetry, and music, is open to a wide scale of interpretation. While there are some interesting perspectives on and interpretations of this poem, my teacher interpreted the poem as an abortion procedure. The notion of a fetal metaphor blew me away—it was so obvious, yet I’d never thought of poetry in that manner. As a 13 year old, I thought the imagery in the poem was ‘out of sight,’ and I was just as interested in grossing out everyone in my classroom as I dramatically recited the poem from memory. After that experience, and delving into e. e. cummings, Robert Frost, and other poets, the song lyrics I began to write changed in tone and character. I became more aware of metaphor,
simile, allegory, alliteration, irony, and other literary devices in song lyrics of Simon & Garfunkel, Joni Mitchell, Jim Morrison, Donovan, and others. My understandings of the possibilities of songs, and my song writing, expanded and matured. I have also used pre-existing poetry to compose songs, as in the following music example.

Brown Penny

While I could write an extended essay around that single song—how and why I wrote the melody, why I harmonized it in a jazz idiom, and why I have chosen tonality as a metaphor for the present article—it is important to leave it open to interpretation, because at some point I admit that all forms of research are open to interpretation (see Gouzouasis, 2008). I will discuss the role of interpretation in explanation later in the essay.

Resonant reflection: Does music inform through metaphor?

“Understanding is not to be thought of so much as an action of one’s subjectivity, but as the placing of oneself within a process of tradition, in which past and present are constantly fused.” (Gadamer, 1975, p. 258)

One may consider that all researchers have certain predispositions and presuppositions that are essentially rooted in ontological and epistemological concerns. xx Some of those concerns are more limited in scope, in horizon, than others. Moreover, one’s predispositions and presuppositions constitute a personal horizon, a depth of perception and understanding of worldviews, research programs, and metatheoretical perspectives. My notion of a horizon is influenced by Hans-Georg Gadamer, who describes the process of interpreting a text as the fusion of one’s own horizon with the horizon of the text. Gadamer defines horizon in the following manner: “Every finite presentation has its limitations. We define the concept of ‘situation’ by saying that it represents a standpoint that limits the possibility of vision. Hence, an essential part of the concept of situation is the concept of ‘Horizon.’ The horizon is the range of vision that includes everything that can be seen from a particular vantage point … A person who has no horizon is a man who does not see far enough and hence overvalues what is nearest to him. Contrariwise, to have a horizon means not to be limited to what is nearest, but to be able to see beyond it ... The working out of the hermeneutical situation means the achievement of the right horizon of enquiry for the questions evoked by the encounter with tradition” (1988, p. 269).

In a Gadamerian context, a fusion of the “horizon” takes place between the speaker and listeners—for me, it takes place between the writer-researcher and readers of a particular research paper. It is a reading the moves beyond the text and into the authors intent to evoke feelings, thoughts, images, sounds, movement, and music. It is the metaphor that I am developing that fuses me, a musicianresearcherteacher. It is a dialectically functioning concept. Taken one step further, it becomes the process of interpreting the text and music, as well as the metaphor—a fusion of one’s own

xx In some ways I am being generous since most postmodernists only speak of epistemology and ignore descriptive metaphysics (ontology) in their texts. If one considers that epistemology is the relationship between the knower and the known, it seems reasonable to suggest that postmodernists explain the nature (ontological characteristics) of what they consider to be realm of “the known.” If it is all culturally based (i.e., the environment), then the entire postmodernist argument collapses into a physicalist, materialist, realist interpretation of reality, which then raises the question of the nature of human spirit (which in 2012 is inexplicable on physicalist, materialist, realist levels) in postmodernist texts.
aural horizon with the horizon of the word (aural, written text). It is a process of fusing artography and tonality.

It is a hermeneutic process, an attempt “to clarify the conditions in which understanding takes place” (Gadamer, 1975, p. 263). In and of itself, hermeneutics (ερμηνευτική) may be considered as an explanatory metaphor, since it is rooted in the Greek name, Ερμηνεύς, Hermes (i.e., an interpreter, a person who clarifies meanings). xxiv In artography, music can clarify the text and the text may clarify the music, just as the research informs the art form and the art form informs the research. It provides deeper understandings of possibilities of living as a musician, as a researcher, and as a teacher who writes about experiences. It makes me whole, placing me in s/p/laces of holistic understanding of why I think, play, perform, compose, and write the way I do. As such, engagement with the artographic process has the potential to broaden the horizon of music researchers.

While I have provided somewhat detailed descriptions of the creative, artographic process of a few of my research presentations and papers, I have left the interpretations of those compositions, as well as the storytelling included herein, open to the reader for consideration based on the theoretical orientation of hermeneutics and metaphor. xxv One reason is because interpretation is not a new concept in the performance of music notation (i.e., music “texts”). Any piece of music can be performed in a multitude of ways—with varying instruments, accompaniment, and styles. Of course, performance practice is always a consideration in a particular historical, cultural, and stylistic context. In consideration, since Hermes is so closely linked with the development of music, it seems reasonable to suggest that we consider hermeneutics to be not only concerned with the interpretation of words—both spoken and written texts—but with the interpretation of both music and arts based texts of music. In other words, since the art form influences the research, and the research influences the art form—a holistic dialectic—the horizon of hermeneutics seems to be as open to interpretation as the interpretation may be considered hermeneutic in a variety of representational forms.

From my horizon, or vantage point, music education research has clearly developed along the strands of Pepper’s (1942) root theoretical stances over the past 100 years. Those stances may be traced through quasi-experimental and correlational studies of music learning, as well as in the essays of music education philosophers over the past 100 years. For me, like the vast majority of the music of the Western classical tradition, metaphorically speaking this body of work all sounds like music in major and minor tonalities. xxvi Yet the music found throughout the world is much more than major and minor. And music learning (i.e., music making) is much broader than what has been written about in the corpus of music education research since the early 20th century. xxvii The work of my profession has developed a “historically effected consciousness” (in German, wirkungsgeschichtliches Bewuβtsein), and where it may seem that some writers have broken away from the past, because of the inextricable union of modernist and post-modernist thought, research in music education not only continues to be mired in 20th century traditions, but attempts to apply 20th century methods to 21st century research problems in 21st century music teaching and learning contexts.

xxi In Greek, an interpreter is a “dihermineas” (διερμηνέας). The Greek god Hermes was the herald, or interpreter, of the messages of the Greek gods. Son of Zeus, he was also a natural born musician—the inventor of the lyre, which according to various accounts had nine chords (i.e., strings) in honor of the nine muses, four strings to represent the seasons, or seven strings to correspond to the seven pitches of the diatonic scale. He also invented the panpipe (syrinx), which he gave to Apollo along with the lyre. Moreover, he assisted in the creation of the musical scale and alphabet with the Three Fates (all women, they are Clotho, Lachesis, and Atropos). See Graves, pp. 68–71.

xxii It is plausible to consider that if Gadamer had been a musician, he may have expanded his notions of hermeneutics beyond texts to the interpretation of music (and perhaps to visual art and dance).

xxiii While they sound very different on a melodic level, both major and minor tonalities emphasize the importance of tonic, subdominant and dominant as characteristic chords (i.e., with a “major” sounding subdominant
It is evident from reading the music education research literature of the last century that much of the music education research community is still mired in positivist and post-positivist research models. Thus, living as an arts-based educational researcher—an a/r/tographer in music s/p/l/aces (deCosson, 2004)—is all the more challenging at this point time. The development of new research frames in our profession involves a new interpretation of what comprises “validity”, that is, if such a term exists at all; see Gouzouasis, 2008) in the pursuit of research in general, as well as in the consideration of what constitutes data, data analysis and interpretation, and research “conclusions” in music education research. It also requires different ways of listening to and composing research texts, music, and music-infused texts.

From a hermeneutic perspective, in this essay I have focused on interpretation in artography and related, arts-based educational research forms (e.g., autoethnographic narrative). Some readers may interpret that I attempted to shift the characteristics of the short stories (i.e., the tonal explorations at the beginning of the essay) in a manner that parallels the shift in the characteristics of the compositions I have chosen. The storied descriptions were personal inquiries, rooted in life events, and recalled with the intent of using them as pedagogical tools. As such, they are vignettes of teachable moments, storied snapshots, applicable to a variety of learning settings. While I tried to change the characteristics of the two stories, (1) my writing was by no means note-for-note, word-by-word, measurable, and positivistic, and (2) I intended the shifts of character in my writing (i.e., shifts in tonality) to resonate as transformative shifts in different tonal settings. Moreover, if one thinks in terms of modality, the shift in music modes paralleled the shifts in story telling modes.

On another level, one may consider that mixolydian tonality is more commonly found in Western popular and some folk songs. The quality of the story in Tonal exploration 1 was intended to be more common, less complex, and more simplistic in pedagogical application. It is a story about becoming an artographer that may ring true with many readers who have had similar life shaping experiences through the arts. Moreover, while more common in nursing and sports activity research, stories similar to the one I shared in Tonal exploration 2 are rarer in the music education research literature. No one is attempting to write and explore this kind of work. From another perspective, across the tonal explorations and subsequent discussion, my narrative voice changed in many ways. Metaphorically, it seems reasonable to suggest that as a writer storying myself, who is cognizant of the impact of shifts in tonality on thought and expression, I am the same person writing the stories, but characteristics of my self—as musician, performer, teacher, writer, researcher—change over the course of composing the explorations and the essay as a whole.

Another reason why thinking about ways that shifts in tonalities, with and without shifts in tuning systems, may work as a metaphor for storying oneself is that the character of my playing the guitar changes when I play music in different tonalities.
That is not to say that I play more “happy” in lydian or major tonality, and “sadly” in dorian or aeolian tonality. I also have not discussed considerations of changes in tempo, because there are as many songs in slow and fast tempos in dorian and major tonality. However, tonality has an effect on the way I approach development of an accompaniment to a slip jig, reel, or jig. Depending on the melody, I harmonize it in a particular way, I explore a variety of rhythmic motives to develop the accompaniment, and I play with articulation and dynamics to set the style and mood. But that can change, either deliberately or on a whim, in a variety of settings and circumstances.

Heart to the ladies & Walkin’ the floor

Obviously, one of the troubling aspects to writing this paper is the level of explanation needed to bring the reader to a basic level of understanding about the functions of music, specifically tonality, in developing the music metaphor. xxvii I recognize the difficulties in considering a single concept of music, even one as important as tonality, as an overarching explanatory device (i.e., a metaphor). As a whole, music has been used as a metaphor to describe various aspects of language, and language learning has been used as a metaphor, albeit somewhat disputed in some academic circles, to describe music learning (see Gouzouasis & Taggart, 1995).

At some points, all metaphors fall short. They are not meant to be precise, mechanical descriptors. Along the same lines, theories also fall short and few theories (if any) in science, psychology, and educational research are perfect. Even with imperfections, theories are not necessarily abandoned, and some that have been placed aside for decades resurface to provide explanation and help in understanding new problems and issues (Laudan, 1977). That may be the case, for some readers, with using tonality as a metaphor in (re)search to (in)form the art form and the art form to (in)form the (re)search. But to quote an old adage I was recently reminded of, “all re-search is a form of me-search.” xxviii If autoethnography is “writing about the personal and its relationship to culture” as “an autobiographical genre of writing that displays multiple layers of consciousness” (Ellis, 2004, p. 37), this essay demonstrates that musicians can write about polyphonic aspects of personal change in relation to multiple layers of music elements and concepts that are cultural artifacts.

I call my ideas to resonate, in words and music, and for you to consider tonality, in metaphor and artographic rendering, as a way to inform research. Composing music-imbued autobiography has become both an epiphany (Denzin, 2001) and epiphony, xxix moving me beyond an assemblage of sound and text to transform the ways I consider writing music research, writing the self, and rendering artography. It becomes a holistic, embodied process. It can also heal grief (Lee, 2006a) and loss (Lee, 2006b). While Cone & Harris (2000) evoke “a holistic approach to reflection that involves … intellectual and emotional capacities, as well as written and oral skills” (p. 33), music-imbued narratives inspire us to involve aural, oral, and compositional skills that radically change the possibilities and ways we hear, see, and comprehend.

xxvi When the original essay had seven explorations in all seven diatonic tonalities this statement was more resonant, but I believe the imaginative reader can conceptually ‘hear,’ or audiate, the possibilities.

xxvii Another barrier is the clumsy nature of the use of digital technology in online journals in 2013. This paper would work much better if it was completely interactive with music and text, i.e., the music embedded in the text and running in the background without leaving the pdf file of the paper to access the music on another web site.

xxviii My sincere thanks to Danny Bakan for sharing this quote.

xxix In Greek, the prefix “epi” (ἐπί) means above, over, beyond, in addition to; the suffix “phone” (φόνως) means voice, sound. The word is also related to the name of a guitar manufacturer, Epiphone, and that relationship is intended.
texts. Writing from the heart (Pelias, 2004) and thinking musically, I was challenged to delve into an ambiguous realm of discovery, creating openings for myself and others to engage with the subjective, often ambiguous nature of music concepts and autobiographical writing on both intellectual and emotional levels.

As a covert, handful of musicians continue to explore and experiment with arts-based educational research methods, one can only hope that the music profession opens parameters, horizons, concepts, minds, hearts, and ears to contribute to contemporary arts-based educational research dialogues, and that the profession embraces those dialogues as a possible future of music education research. The possibilities are endless and it cannot happen too soon.
REFERENCES


Humphrey, G. (1924). The psychology of the gestalt. *Journal of Educational Psychology, 15*(7), 401-412.


